Degenerative Dementias and Their Medical Care in the Movies

Kurt Segers, MD*
‡

Abstract: Compared with other neurologic problems, few films have been dedicated to degenerative dementia. To our knowledge, this is the first systematic review about the way in which dementia patients and their medical care are described in films. Twenty-four of the 53 relevant films that were found in online movie databases could be viewed. The author describes the demographics of the characters suffering from dementia, the clinical picture including neuropsychiatric manifestations, diagnostic procedures, medical follow-up, pharmacologic and nonpharmacologic treatment and the attitude of the caregivers.

Most characters are played by actors in their seventh or eighth decade. There is an overrepresentation of highly educated people. Although the clinical picture is often accurate, some films suggest that even in the late stages of the disease patients have sudden moments of full insight in their disease. Among the neuropsychiatric signs, activity disturbances and aggressiveness are most often described. Few patients seek medical help, only 2 patients take acetylcholinesterase inhibitors and follow-up is absent for 5 of the 11 relevant patients. Only in 10 of 23 films, the term “Alzheimer” is used. Although there is a growing cinematographic interest in Alzheimer patients, even recent films tend to reinforce therapeutic and even diagnostic nihilism.

Key Words: Alzheimer disease, dementia, fiction films, therapeutic nihilism

(Alzheimer Dis Assoc Disord 2006;00:000–000)

The demographic structure of the human population is dramatically changing. The rapid increase of the number of aged individuals is not limited to the Western countries and the World Health Organization expects that by 2025 about 823 million people will be older than 65. As degenerative dementias are age-related conditions, this global ageing is likely to be reflected in a rapid increase of their prevalence too. The latter will not only have a tremendous socio-economic impact, but it will probably also have further consequences that might change all aspects of our society, including popular culture.

Television and cinema have an important influence on how the general public sees diseases and patients. In the industrialized countries, people spend about 3 hours a day, or half of their leisure time, watching television. Fiction confronts the audience with health problems like suicide, alcoholism, or psychiatric illnesses. The impact of fiction films should not be underestimated: although most individuals with autism manifest moderate mental retardation, Dustin Hoffman’s character Raymond Babbitt in “Rain Man” (1988) has left a persistent image in our collective consciousness of the autistic patient as a kind of idiot savant.

With their profound interference with normal functioning, neurologic conditions have always been popular in movies, especially coma and pure memory loss.

Dementia, on the contrary, has only seldom been the subject of films, probably because it affects mainly elderly people and the bad prognosis is not likely to generate cheerful films with happy endings. In a personal communication, Vicki Patik, the writer of “Do You Remember Love?,” which might be the first film in which the term “Alzheimer disease (AD)” was coined, mentioned that the network CBS initially refused financing the film because “no one would want to watch a film about something as depressing as Alzheimer’s.”

As a consequence, there is almost no medical literature about dementia in fiction. Dastoor reviewed 4 films and 1 documentary, all from before 1988.

To the author’s knowledge, this is the first systematic review of the depiction of dementia patients and their medical care in fiction films.

METHODS

Fiction films, TV films, or shorts released before 2005 and dealing with a main character suffering from a degenerative dementia were searched using IMDb Pro, the professional version of the Internet Movie Database (http://www.pro.imdb.com), a commercial online database containing 373,164 relevant titles from 1888 to 2004. Using the Advanced Search option, title queries were done searching the words “Alzheimer,” “dementia,” “memory loss,” and “senile” in the titles, keywords, and plot outlines. Plot outlines were screened on their relevance. Additional films were found using the same
TABLE 1. Neuropsychiatric Manifestations in 25 Characters, Grouped in the Main Domains of the First Part of the BEHAVE-AD

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Symptomatology</th>
<th>No. Patients (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Activity disturbances</td>
<td>14 (56)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aggressiveness</td>
<td>12 (48)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Affective disturbance</td>
<td>9 (36)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Delusions</td>
<td>9 (36)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anxiety and phobias</td>
<td>3 (12)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Diurnal rhythm disturbances</td>
<td>3 (12)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hallucinations</td>
<td>0 (0)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

the association between the patient and the doctors or creative artists.

**RESULTS**

Films

Twenty-four films were viewed, of which 4 were short films and 2 were TV films. Seventy-five percent were American productions or coproductions. Release dates ranged from 1970 to 2004.

Demographics

Most characters with degenerative dementia are played by actors in their seventh or eighth decade, with the exception of the short “Diagnosis” in which a young girl tells she has been diagnosed with Lewy body disease, although she has no physical signs of the illness. Two-thirds of the characters are women. About 80% live at home, the rest of them being institutionalized. The role of the latter is often limited to lying in bed, as in “Agnes of God” or “Noel,” probably to stress the importance of the various psychologic problems of their children. In the oldest movie, the black comedy “Where’s Poppa?” institutionalization is still such a taboo that Gordon, the son of the patient, starts stuttering each time he tries to pronounce the word “home.”

**Clinical Picture**

Few screenwriters seem to have difficulties in depicting adequately the typical semantic memory deficit and the difficulties with retrieving recently learned information. One character in “Folks!” sums it up nicely: “1943 he remembers like yesterday. It’s yesterday he can’t remember like yesterday.” Still, there are some exceptions:

- The cognitive profile of Allie in “The Notebook” is not very convincing. Because she cannot remember even the main events of her own life anymore, her husband Noah reads her every day from her own autobiography. Although Allie does not recognize her own husband and children anymore, she does not seem to have difficulties with following the plotline of the story that Noah has been telling her over the course of several days. In the resolving scene at the end of the film, she suddenly realizes that she and her husband are the main characters in this love story. As she recognizes her husband this is followed by a brief moment of lucidity and profound insight in her disease process.
- In the slapstick comedy “Folks!,” Harold Aldrich, who has been completely unaware of the catastrophes he seems to invoke on his son, has a similar unique and unrealistic moment of complete lucidity and insight in which he proposes to commit suicide and to make it look like an accident to collect the life insurance of himself and his wife.
- The clinical picture of Mr Stein in “Speed of Life” is hallmarkd by a subcortical dementia with slowing of thoughts, cerebellar ataxia, and epileptic insults, which makes the diagnosis of AD improbable. Not surprisingly, his doctor tells his son that there is probably something else going on. According to the author and director Robert Schmidt in a personal communication, the character of Mr Stein was based on his own father, who during his life was suspected having AD but there were no typical signs of Alzheimer’s...
pathology on brain autopsy, which rather suggested a form of encephalitis.

That AD is not only affecting memory but also various other cognitive faculties is very well illustrated in “Safe House.” In this thriller Mace Sowell, a retired secret agent, has locked himself up in a villa that is equipped with high tech surveillance instruments. The screenwriters skillfully manage to incorporate what seem to be paranoid delusions of the main character in the plot and even the progressive diminishing of his visuoconstructive capacities seem to play an important role in story development.

Neuropsychiatric Manifestations

The prevalence of neuropsychiatric manifestations were scored using the different items of the first part of the BEHAVE-AD (Table 1). Three characters had no neuropsychiatric disturbances at all. This seems comparable with findings in real life AD patients, although methodology differed.8

Diagnosis and Follow-up

Only in 58% of the films is there direct or indirect evidence of the fact that the patient has consulted a doctor and that the diagnosis of AD has been made. The initiative to consult a doctor was not statistically different between films from before and after the millennium change. The off-handed manner in which characters, including doctors, talk about the disease does not seem to have changed either: only in 43% or ten of the 23 films (excluding “Diagnosis” for dealing with Lewy body disease) the word “Alzheimer” is used. In “The Notebook,” a young doctor uses the obsolete term “senile dementia” when talking to Noah and he follows with “It’s irreversible, it’s degenerative.” Only 5 of the 11 characters who live at home and where a doctor has made the diagnosis seem to benefit from a medical follow-up.

Some movies shortly focus on the diagnostic process itself. In “Folks!” it is a retired doctor who, by sheer observation of his friend, suggests the diagnosis to his son. No further clinical investigations are requested. Even the doctor suffering from AD in “Time to say goodbye!” has only a brief neuropsychologic examination before his colleague makes the diagnosis. In “A Song For Martin,” it is suggested that the neurologist recognizes the disease after inspecting a brain scan. Only the series of prediagnostic tests in “Do You Remember Love?” can really convince of the earnestness of the clinical examination, although a brain angiogram can hardly be said to be part of clinical routine in the diagnosis of AD.

Medication

Tacrine, the first central inhibitor of acetylcholinesterase, was approved by the American Food and Drug Administration in 1993. In only 2 of the 17 reviewed films that were released after 1997 (considering that it takes several years from writing a first draft of a scenario to the release of the eventual movie and after excluding “Kaas” because its script was based on a book written in 1933), there is evidence of the character being treated with this class of drugs. In 1998, the American movie audience could see for the first and last time a character using cholinesterase inhibitors on a regular basis: Mace Sowell, the secret agent in “Safe House,” a film which was never distributed in Europe. The only other patient taking tacrine is Ledda, the professional killer in “The Alzheimer Affair,” but he actually uses it like Popeye takes spinach, as a kind of boost for his memory during episodes of confusion. In “A Song For Martin,” Martin’s neurologist advises against the use of cholinesterase inhibitors, because “love and mental gymnastics are the best treatment.” The use of more recent cholinesterase inhibitors or memantine, an N-methyl-D-aspartate receptor antagonist only approved by the Food and Drug Administration in October 2003, have not yet started a movie career.

Despite the use of older medications in the treatment of neuropsychiatric manifestations, the characters seem rather under-treated compared with real life: only 3 of 25 patients take psychotropics on a regular basis.

Nonpharmacologic Interventions

The use of mnemotechnic aids seems only a privilege for professional killers and secret agents. Just like in “The Notebook” the grandson of Rose in “The Remembering Movies” tries to stimulate the memory of his grandmother by giving her autobiographic information.

In “Kaas,” on the basis of the novel with the same name by Willem Elsschot, the family of the demented mother has noticed that her purposeless activity is not necessarily a symptom that should be suppressed: all children bring their potatoes to her house to get them peeled.

The husband in “Down in the Delta” excels in the use of various environmental and other nonpharmacologic interventions for episodes of delusional thinking or agitation.

Caregivers

Most characters being in stage 5 to 7 of the GDS (mean: 5.5, range 0 to 7), they have to rely on the help of their caregivers to survive. Only Vada’s very demented grandmother in the romantic comedy “My Girl” does not seem to need assistance in daily life. The character’s dependence, often on one single nonprofessional caregiver, is frequently a source of frustrations and conflicts for the caregiver and leads to verbal (“A Song for Martin,” “Iris”) and physical abuse (“My Mother’s Keeper”). In the opening scene of “Where’s Poppa?” Gordon, disguised as a gorilla, tries to scare his mother to death. In “Time to Say Goodbye!” doctor Klooster becomes a ping-pong ball in the conflict between his family members about his right to commit suicide. In “Speed of Life” Drew, having become a victim of caregiver depression and burn-out, will kill his father eventually.
DISCUSSION

Contemporary cinema industry becomes more and more interested in stories about patients suffering from degenerative dementia and their caregivers: 28 of the 53 films dealing with the subject were released after 1999, which is about 2.5 times more than expected by the total movie production for both eras. The author was able to view only 24 films (with 25 characters suffering from AD) of these 52 films and there are without a doubt films that have been neglected. Films that could not be found were not older or younger than the reviewed films, but were more likely to be TV films or shorts (50% vs. 25% of the reviewed films) or to be produced outside the United States (63% vs. 25%). TV films, shorts, and European or Asian films are less likely to benefit from wide distribution than American theater films are, and therefore they probably will have a minor impact on how the public thinks about AD.

Most films seem to be rather well documented about the clinical picture of AD, including neuropsychiatric manifestations. Wandering seems to be an especially popular theme, probably because it gives the screenwriter the occasion to change rapidly and unexpectedly the story’s location, to create tension and to introduce new characters or conflicts. “Folks!” and “Travelling Companion” are basically a form of road movies by getting their narrative drive almost exclusively from the patient’s permanent state of wandering. Delusions too can bring important momentum changes in the film’s plot. A very clever illustration in the mechanisms underlying delusional thinking can be found in “Where’s Poppy?” in which Mrs Hocheiser first has to mistake her personal nurse for her own son before she can accuse her of being an impostor. Surprisingly, no single scenario contains episodes of visual hallucinations, although they might be cinematographically interesting and are present in 13% to 80% of the population suffering from AD.9

In contrast to the clinical accuracy, there is a remarkable therapeutic and even diagnostic nihilism which is not limited to older films: often the patient and his family do not seem to find it important to consult a doctor, and even in that case therapeutic interventions and further follow-up of the patient are rarely mentioned. Hereby they reinforce the disease being one of the last medical taboos. This makes fictional doctors not much different from their colleagues in real life. From questionnaires sent to general practitioners (with 24 films reviewed) or to be produced outside the United States (63% vs. 25%). TV films, shorts, and European or Asian films are less likely to benefit from wide distribution than American theater films are, and therefore they probably will have a minor impact on how the public thinks about AD.

One must not forget that the way in which patients are portrayed by screenwriters and actors is primarily intended to serve a dramatic than an educational purpose. This is illustrated by the screenwriters’ choice for highly educated people, probably in an attempt to make the impact of the forgetting as dramatic as possible: just like it’s probably worse for a piano player to lose his hand than to miss a leg, they suggest that the decline of cognitive functioning is harder to accept for intellectuals. Nevertheless, screenwriters should be aware of the influence they can have on the public opinion and might consider to contribute in the fight against prejudice through collaboration with doctors and patients organizations.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

The author thanks Dr Anne Clara for suggesting several film titles, Steven Buyle for transferring tapes to VHS-PAL format and the writers, directors or producers Georgia Lee, Vickie Patik, John Patch, Christopher N. Rowley, Rob Schmidt, Melissa Strong, and Mike Yakovich for being so kind to provide a copy of their film.

REFERENCES

APPENDIX A

List of viewed films containing one or more characters suffering from degenerative dementia, in chronologic order.

1. Where’s poppa? (Carl Reiner, USA, 1970)
2. On Golden Pond (Mark Rydell, USA, 1981)
3. Agnes of God (Norman Jewison, USA, 1985)
4. Do You Remember Love (TV movie, Jeff Bleckner, USA, 1985)
5. My Girl (Howard Zieff, USA, 1991)
6. Folks! (Ted Kotcheff, USA, 1992)
7. Travelling Companion (original title “Compagna di viaggio,” Peter Del Monte, Italy, 1996)
8. Time to say goodbye? (David Jones, USA, 1997)
9. Down in the delta (Maya Angelou, USA, 1998)
10. Safe House (TV movie, Eric Steven Stahl, USA, 1998)
11. Kaas (Orlow Seunke, Belgium 1999)
12. Speed of life (also known as “Saturn”) (Robert Schmidt, USA, 1999)
13. Firefly dreams (original title “Ichiban utskushi natsu”), John Williams, Japan, 2001
14. Iris (Richard Eyre, UK, 2001)
15. A Song for Martin (original title “En Sång för Martin,” Bille August, Sweden, 2001)
16. Son of the bride (original title “El Hijo de la novia” Juan José Campanella, Argentina, 2001)
17. The Remembering Movies (short, Cristopher N. Rowley, USA, 2002)
22. Diagnosis (short, Georgia Lee, USA, 2004)
23. Noel (Chazz Palminteri, USA, 2004)